This article was downloaded by: [Jiri Rohn] On: 18 July 2012, At: 05:12 Publisher: Taylor & Francis Informa Ltd Registered in England and Wales Registered Number: 1072954 Registered office: Mortimer House, 37-41 Mortimer Street, London W1T 3JH, UK



## Linear and Multilinear Algebra

Publication details, including instructions for authors and subscription information: http://www.tandfonline.com/loi/glma20

Letter to the editor

Jiri Rohn<sup>a</sup>

<sup>a</sup> Institute of Computer Science, Czech Academy of Sciences, Prague, Czech Republic

Version of record first published: 18 Jul 2012

To cite this article: Jiri Rohn (2012): Letter to the editor, Linear and Multilinear Algebra, DOI:10.1080/03081087.2012.698617

To link to this article: <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/03081087.2012.698617</u>



PLEASE SCROLL DOWN FOR ARTICLE

Full terms and conditions of use: <u>http://www.tandfonline.com/page/terms-and-conditions</u>

This article may be used for research, teaching, and private study purposes. Any substantial or systematic reproduction, redistribution, reselling, loan, sub-licensing, systematic supply, or distribution in any form to anyone is expressly forbidden.

The publisher does not give any warranty express or implied or make any representation that the contents will be complete or accurate or up to date. The accuracy of any instructions, formulae, and drug doses should be independently verified with primary sources. The publisher shall not be liable for any loss, actions, claims, proceedings, demand, or costs or damages whatsoever or howsoever caused arising directly or indirectly in connection with or arising out of the use of this material. Linear and Multilinear Algebra 2012, 1–2, iFirst



## Letter to the editor

Jiri Rohn\*

Institute of Computer Science, Czech Academy of Sciences, Prague, Czech Republic

Communicated by S. Kirkland

(Received 8 October 2011; final version received 28 May 2012)

It is shown that the recent characterization of strong feasibility of interval linear equations by Karademir and Prokopyev was in fact published by this author 13 years earlier. The original result was difficult to discover, having been embedded, together with its proof, into the proof of another theorem.

Keywords: interval linear equations; strong feasibility; Farkas-type theorem

AMS Subject Classifications: 15A06; 65G40

Recently, Karademir and Prokopyev [2] published a Farkas-type theorem for strong feasibility of interval linear equations. They stated without proof that a system of interval linear equations  $\mathbf{A}x = \mathbf{b}$  with  $\mathbf{A} = [A_c - \Delta, A_c + \Delta]$  and  $\mathbf{b} = [b_c - \delta, b_c + \delta]$  is strongly feasible if and only if the system

$$A_c^T y + \Delta^T |y| \ge 0, \tag{1}$$

$$b_c^T y - \delta^T |y| < 0 \tag{2}$$

has no solution (where the absolute value of a vector is taken entrywise). By definition [1], a system  $\mathbf{A}x = \mathbf{b}$  is called strongly feasible if Ax = b has a nonnegative solution for each  $A \in \mathbf{A}$ ,  $b \in \mathbf{b}$ . In [2], the authors made the comment 'The proof is similar to the proof of Proposition 1 [2] and is omitted here'.

Karademir and Prokopyev [2] were not aware, however, of the fact that both this result and its proof were published in [3] as part (1) of the proof of Theorem 1, included as an auxiliary tool for proving a statement of NP-hardness of linear programming with inexact data. So, the result was not stated in [3] as an independent theorem, having been embedded, together with its proof, into the proof of another theorem. No wonder, therefore, that the result went unnoticed.

In what follows, we give a verbatim copy of the result and its proof as it was published in [3] as part (1) of the proof of Theorem 1 there. The quoted part is included into quotation marks.

'(1) First we prove that each system

$$Ax = b, \quad x \ge 0 \tag{3}$$

ISSN 0308–1087 print/ISSN 1563–5139 online © 2012 Taylor & Francis http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/03081087.2012.698617 http://www.tandfonline.com

<sup>\*</sup>Email: rohn@cs.cas.cz

J. Rohn

with data satisfying

$$A \in \mathbf{A}, \quad b \in \mathbf{b} \tag{4}$$

has a solution if and only if

$$(\forall y) \left( A_c^T y + \Delta^T |y| \ge 0 \Rightarrow b_c^T y - \delta^T |y| \ge 0 \right)$$
(5)

holds. "Only if": Let each system (3) with data (4) have a solution, and let  $A_c^T y + \Delta^T |y| \ge 0$  for some  $y \in \mathbb{R}^m$ . Define a diagonal matrix T by  $T_{ii} = 1$  if  $y_i \ge 0$ ,  $T_{ii} = -1$  if  $y_i < 0$ , and  $T_{ij} = 0$  if  $i \ne j$  (i, j = 1, ..., m), then |y| = Ty. Consider now the system

$$(A_c + T\Delta)x = b_c - T\delta, \quad x \ge 0.$$
(6)

Since  $A_c + T\Delta \in \mathbf{A}$  and  $b_c - T\delta \in \mathbf{b}$ , the system (6) has a solution according to the assumption, and  $(A_c + T\Delta)^T y = A_c^T y + \Delta^T |y| \ge 0$ , hence FARKAS lemma applied to (6) gives that  $b_c^T y - \delta^T |y| = (b_c - T\delta)^T y \ge 0$ , which proves (5). "If": Assuming that (5) holds, consider a system (3) with data satisfying (4). Let  $A^T y \ge 0$  for some y; then  $A_c^T y + \Delta^T |y| \ge (A_c + A - A_c)^T y = A^T y \ge 0$ , hence (5) gives that  $b^T y = (b_c + b - b_c)^T y \ge b_c^T y - \delta^T |y| \ge 0$ . Thus, we have proved that for each y,  $A^T y \ge 0$  implies  $b^T y \ge 0$ , and FARKAS lemma proves the existence of a solution to (3)'.

Obviously, (5) is equivalent to the nonexistence of a solution to (1), (2).

The fact that Karademir and Prokopyev [2] were unaware of the result in [3] is not surprising, for the result was so well-hidden that it was hard to discover in [3]. Moreover, it was not included into the survey chapter in [1] in order not to disturb the unified approach there.

This author is embarrassed to admit that while acting as a reviewer of this article [2], he did not recognize his own result there; the fact came to him only later.

## References

- M. Fiedler, J. Nedoma, J. Ramík, J. Rohn, and K. Zimmermann, *Linear Optimization Problems with Inexact Data*, Springer-Verlag, New York, 2006.
- [2] S. Karademir and O.A. Prokopyev, A short note on solvability of systems of interval linear equations, Linear Multilinear Algebra 59 (2011), pp. 707–710.
- [3] J. Rohn, Linear programming with inexact data is NP-hard, Zeitsch. Angew. Math. Mech. 78 (1998), pp. S1051–S1052.